

Chullin – Simanim

פרק א – הכל שוחטין

דף טו – 15 Daf

1. *Machlokes* when food cooked on Shabbos is forbidden to eat

Rav Ashi finally explains that our Mishnah, which indicates that meat *shechted* on Shabbos is only permitted after Shabbos, reflects Rebbe Yehudah's view regarding *one who cooks on Shabbos*. A Mishnah records three opinions: Rebbe Meir says if he cooked *בשוגג*, he may eat the food, but if he cooked *במזיד*, no one may eat it until enough time passes for it to have been cooked after Shabbos (to prevent benefiting from the transgression). Rebbe Yehudah says if he cooked *בשוגג*, he (or anyone) may eat it after Shabbos, but if he cooked *במזיד*, then *לא יאכל* – *he may never eat it*, though others may eat it after Shabbos. Rebbe Yochanan HaSandlar says if he cooked *בשוגג*, he may never eat it, but others may eat it after Shabbos, but if he cooked *במזיד*, the food may never be eaten by anyone. The Gemara proceeds to explain why our Mishnah cannot reflect the opinion of Rebbe Meir or Rebbe Yochanan HaSandlar.

2. A healthy person eating food which was *shechted* or cooked for a *חולה* on Shabbos

Rav says: *השוחט לחולה בשבת* – if *one shechts for a critically ill person on Shabbos*, *אסור לבריא* – [the meat] *is forbidden to a healthy person* that day, because it is *מוקצה* (since the *חולה* only became ill on Shabbos). If one cooks food for a *חולה* on Shabbos, it is permitted for a *בריא*, because the food was *ראוי לבוס* – *fit for chewing* while raw, and is not *מוקצה* (as opposed to an animal before *shechitah*). Rav Pappa notes exceptions to both statements: if the person was ill *יום מבעוד יום* – *from before* [Shabbos], making it likely that *shechitah* would be necessary on Shabbos, the meat is not *מוקצה*. Cooked food would be prohibited for a *בריא* if a gourd was cut from a tree and cooked, because the gourd is *מוקצה*. Rav Dimi of Nehardea said the *halachah* is that if one *shechts* for a *חולה* (who was ill before Shabbos), the meat is permitted to a healthy person *באומצא* – *for chewing* raw. He explains: *כיון דאי אפשר לכזית בשר בלא שחיטה* – *since even a כזית of meat is impossible to eat without shechting* the animal, the entire animal is definitively *shechted* for the *חולה's* benefit. In contrast, if one cooks for a *חולה*, the food is forbidden to a *בריא*, because of a *gezeirah* *שנא* *ירבה בשבילו* – *lest he [cook] more than necessary for [the בריא's benefit]*, which is forbidden.

3. *Shechting* with other implements, *machlokes* about *shechting* with *מחובר*

The next Mishnah states: *השוחט במגל יד בצור ובקנה* – if *one shechts with the blade of a hand sickle, a sharp rock, or a reed*, the *shechitah* is valid. The Mishnah concludes that implements with serrated notches invalidate *shechitah*, *מפני שהם חונקין* – *because they strangle* the animal, rather than slaughter it. The Mishnah's language implies that its first list of implements are only valid for *shechitah* *בדיעבד* – *after the fact*, but should not be used *לכתחלה*. This contradicts a Baraisa, which states: *בכל שוחטין בין בצור בין בזכוכית בין בקרומית של קנה* – *one may shecht with anything, whether with a rock, glass, or stem of a reed!*? The Gemara answers that our Mishnah's case is *במחובר* – *while it is attached* to the ground, which is only valid *בדיעבד*, but not *לכתחלה*. *Shechting* with *מחובר* is a *machlokes* Tannaim, and after some discussion, the Gemara concludes that Rebbe Chiya permits it *לכתחלה*, and Rebbe holds that *מחובר* *מעיקרו* – *something which was always attached* to the ground invalidates *shechitah* completely, whereas *תלוש ולבסוף* – *something detached which he later attached* to the ground is valid *בדיעבד*.

Siman – Fruit Bowl (ט"ו בשבט)

The man who used a **fruit bowl** to cook fruit soup on Shabbos *בשוגג* and was told that he would have to wait until after Shabbos to eat it, and a man who cooked in a **fruit bowl** for a *חולה* on Shabbos and was told that the food is forbidden for healthy people, were startled when a man smashed a glass **fruit bowl** to use a shard for *shechitah*.

דף טו | DAF 15

Fruit Bowl



The man who used a **fruit bowl** to cook fruit soup on **Shabbos** בשוגג and was told that he would have to wait until after **Shabbos** to eat it, and a man who cooked in a **fruit bowl** for a **חולה** on **Shabbos** and was told that the food is forbidden for healthy people, were startled when a man smashed a glass fruit bowl to use a shard for *shechitah*.

3 things to remember

1. **Machlokes** when food cooked on **Shabbos** is forbidden to eat
2. A healthy person eating food which was *shechted* or cooked for a **חולה** on **Shabbos**
3. **Shechting** with other implements, **machlokes** about *shechting* with מחובר

